This project is funded by the European Union.
**Table of Contents**

I. PROJECT INFORMATION ...........................................................................................................3
II. SUMMARY / STRATEGIC REVIEW AND OUTLOOK .................................................................4
III. CONTEXT ................................................................................................................................5
IV. REVIEW OF PROGRESS AND RESULTS ACHIEVED ................................................................6

   Activity 1: Infrastructure Works/Construction .........................................................................6
   Activity 2: Procurement of equipment ......................................................................................11

V. SUSTAINABILITY OF RESULTS ............................................................................................13
VI. PROJECT RISKS, ISSUES AND ACTION TAKEN ................................................................13
VII. LESSONS LEARNED ............................................................................................................16
VIII. MEDIA COVERAGE / VISIBILITY ........................................................................................17
IX. ANNEXES ............................................................................................................................21
# 1. Project Information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>Title of the programme</strong></th>
<th>“Construction of the Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova”, funded by the European Union, co-funded by the Government of Republic of Moldova, and implemented by UNDP.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Terms</strong></td>
<td>December 22,2014 – December 22,2018</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cost of Action:</strong></td>
<td>EUR 6,189,000.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>National Counterpart</strong></td>
<td>Customs Service of the Republic of Moldova</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus Area</strong></td>
<td>Effective Governance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Beneficiaries Partners</strong></td>
<td>The general public and businesses transiting the state border at Palanca; the Customs Service under the Ministry of Finance of the Republic of Moldova (MD CS), the State Fiscal Service of Ukraine (UA SFS), the Border Police under the Ministry of Internal Affairs of the Republic of Moldova (MD BP), the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine (UA SBGS), as well as food safety authorities (veterinary and phytosanitary agencies) from both countries.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Contract number</strong></td>
<td>Agreement no. ENPI 2014/355-024</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Objectives** | The overall objective of the Action is to create a jointly operated border crossing point (JOBCP) at Palanca, on the territory of the Republic of Moldova, respecting all EU standards and principles of a JOBCP, ensuring improved conditions for business and trade, safe, secure, gender friendly and facilitated movement of people and goods across the border, thus contributing to the economic stabilization and sustainable development of the region.  

The project will also contribute to a wider objective, namely "safer and more open borders" between Ukraine and Moldova. The expected long-term impact is to contribute to the facilitation of trade and migration flows between two countries.

**Specific objectives:**

- Acceleration of the traffic flow due to the simplified border crossing procedures. With unification of control activities and by avoiding duplication of functions using the hand-to-hand and one-stop-shop principle at JOBCP, the average time of the border crossing can be reduced by 20%.

- Enhanced cooperation among the two countries’ agencies responsible for border control. Carrying out activities “under one roof” gives the opportunity for the border control agencies (border guard and customs) and other relevant authorities to raise the level of trust and to come to a common understanding. With joint and well-coordinated activities agencies can reach a higher level of efficiency in trade facilitation and in combating cross-border crime.
• Establishment of a more rapid and secure exchange of information on persons, vehicles and goods, as well as on other issues related to border control procedures. The JOBCP offers the possibility to create the local inter-agency networks for the direct information exchange, which can significantly contribute to the efficiency of the border control procedures.

• Reduction of risks related to such phenomena as corruption. As all border control agencies are working in the same environment and under one roof, the level of transparency is higher, therefore JOBCP in itself is an effective tool for the fight against corruption.

• Reaching a higher level of efficiency and transparency of border guard and customs control through common procedures, and commonly accepted standard operational procedures.

• Improvement of combating cross border crime by the enhanced level of cooperation and possibility to solve the issues on the spot, immediately involving all relevant agencies.

• Reduction of the functioning costs due to the abolishment of the BCPs Mayaki and Udobne in the territory of Ukraine.

II. SUMMARY/ Strategic Review and outlook:

In line with the Contribution Agreement ENPI 2014/355-024 signed between the European Union (EU) and the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) on 22 December 2014 for the execution of the project “Construction of the Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova (Construction of JOBCP Palanca)”, UNDP submits this Final project report, covering the implementation period of December 22, 2014 – December 22, 2018.

UNDP implemented the obligations deriving from the agreement, and namely: (i) finalised the construction of the JOBCP in line with the EU standards and principles of a JOBCP and based on the Infrastructural requirements for implementation of joint control at ‘Palanca’ BCP enclosed in the Description of Action as Appendix I; and (ii) procured and installed the equipment, as per the amended in consultations with the four partner services General list of technical equipment required for construction of Palanca JOBCP, enclosed in the Description of Action as Appendix 2. To highlight that UNDP exceeded the task by the successful mobilisation of additional resources from the Government of the Republic of Moldova in the amount of EUR 560,000.00 as the estimated cost of construction was well below the financial offer of the best bidder, and EUR 629,912.00 for the construction of the access road from the highway Odessa-Reni to the entrance to the JOBCP from Ukraine. Although the road construction works were not part of the initial Description of Action but were added to the project’s tasks through the Addendum no.2 signed on July 2, 2018 the project implemented this task within the initially set project’s timeline.
The constructed JOBCP with the build-in equipment and the access road were transferred into the property of the main project’s partner – the Customs Service of the Republic of Moldova, while the portable equipment was transferred into the property of the particular partner services. These, alongside with the fact that the four partner services started to exercise the joint border control operations on 19 December 2017 at the Temporary BCP that was established to ensure uninterrupted cross-border traffic in Palanca, ensured that the JOBCP became fully and continuously operational from the official launch event attended by the Prime Minister of Moldova, the President of Ukraine, representatives of the EUD and UNDP, as well as of the partner services from two countries and of the local authorities, on December 28, 2018. At the EUD request, the Project vehicle, IT equipment and the furniture were donated to the local public authorities of Palanca village to be used by the local school, the medical centre and other social institutions.

III. CONTEXT

The Moldova-Ukraine common border (total length = 1222 km) consists of 955 km of green border and 267 km of blue border and represents one of the most problematic border segments in the region, being used by irregular migrants heading westwards, whereas the adjacent border area is vulnerable to border and related crime, such as smuggling. The self-proclaimed Transnistrian republic has been for the last twenty-seven years a grey area increasing the risks of illegal activities in the region, particularly along the Ukrainian-Moldovan border. The Transnistrian segment on the Ukraine-Moldova border is a serious obstacle for the passenger and cargo flows between two countries, increasing the role of the BCPs outside Transnistria and raising the demand for their use.

Palanca international road border crossing point (BCP) is one of the BCPs between Moldova and Ukraine that experiences a high workload due to the passenger and cargo traffic avoiding Transnistria. For many years, border guard and customs controls were carried out at three places: BCP Palanca on the Moldovan side of the border was built in 1990 on the edge of Palanca village, and on the Ukrainian side at ‘Mayaki’ BCP which was located 3.5 km from BCP Palanca and ‘Udobne’ BCP which was located 4.3 km from BCP Palanca. A 7.6 km portion of the Ukrainian highway Odessa-Reni between Mayaki and Udobne passes through the territory of the Republic of Moldova. This highway is an important for Ukraine road infrastructure and transport corridor that links Odessa and major cities from the region, as Belgorod-Dnestrovsk, Reni, and Kilia. Based on the bilateral Agreement with Ukraine (1997) the Palanca BCP operated as a Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point from March 1997 until August 2001, when the Ukrainian party unilaterally terminated the “Joint Border Control” operation. Consequently, in 2001 Mayaki (UA) and Udobne (UA) BCPs were established at the two sides of the transit road with the aim of carrying out checks by the Ukrainian border control agencies in these places to ensure that the predominantly domestic traffic did not illicitly cross into Moldova.

The establishment of Palanca JOBCP on the territory of the Republic of Moldova was expected to resolve the problem of the internal Ukrainian traffic, because all types of cross-border control of both countries were to be fulfilled in one place, namely at Palanca JOBCP, without further control at ‘Mayaki’ BCP (Ukraine) and ‘Udobne’ BCP (Ukraine). As the plan was to establish and equip a modern JOBCP in compliance with the EU border management standards, this also contributed to removing BCP Mayaki and BCP Udobne restrictions on the cargo of goods under the groups 1-24 of the Combined Nomenclature of Goods (transportation of animals, plants...
and food stuff made of them) imposed by the Ukrainian part due to the limited control capacity for these types of goods. Also, both BCPs at Mayaki and Udobne were closed, saving human, administrative and financial resources for the Ukrainian border services and facilitating the traffic flow along the highway Odessa-Reni.

IV. REVIEW OF PROGRESS AND RESULTS ACHIEVED

The Project achieved the targets in line with the agreed Work Plan. The construction works were accomplished, including the demolition of the obsolete buildings, expansion and levelling of the BCP territory, site, concrete platform construction, construction of the main administrative building and of the building for the detailed control of cargo, as well as of the control booths, establishment of IT and utilities networks, procurement of the build-in and portable equipment needed to ensure effective operation of the JOBCP and its installation, and construction of the road junction between the JOBCP and Odessa-Reni highway at the exit to Ukraine. The project ensured a minimum interruption of the border crossing during the construction works (two months), establishing a temporary border crossing point that operated in the joint control manner by the Moldovan and the Ukrainian partner services.

Activity 1: Infrastructure Works/Construction

The tender for the design services was announced in April 2015 based on the approved by the Project’ Counterparts technical specifications. All tendering procedures were organized in compliance with UNDP Rules and Procurement procedures. Hence, 8 companies (6 local and 2 from abroad - Egypt and Italy) submitted their bids. As a result of a thorough screening and evaluation, the Moldovan company SC IGC Construct SRL was awarded the contract for the elaboration of the technical design of Palanca JOBCP.

The design for Palanca JOBCP was elaborated within the period of June 2015 - May 2016, by IGC Construct SRL. Five different options were elaborated and consulted with the project partners and EUBAM during July - October 2015. This occurred since the concept of the JOBCP elaborated by the Customs Service of the Republic of Moldova and enclosed with the Description of Action became outdated and required a thorough review, also by the project partners. Moreover, the issue of the access roads of the JOBCP was raised and discussed at the Project Steering Committee Meeting on October 30, 2015. It was argued that the JOBCP would not reach the full capacity and even might not become operational without the enlarged and enhanced access road infrastructure to/from the JOBCP from both sides. The design company was requested to propose an optimal access road infrastructure to ensure the traffic flow to and from the JOBCP from the both sides.

The detailed design of the JOBCP was further revised with a view at the cost-efficiency, as the best financial offer obtained through the open competition surpassed the available budget. The design Contractor made some optimizations of the future facilities, offering more efficient technical solutions for air conditioning, ventilation and heating systems of the administrative building. Additionally, it was decided to exclude some facilities from the master plan: the portal
for the radiation control, one external toilet from the Ukrainian side and the facility for sniffing dogs. Later, when certain savings were obtained due to the change of the approach to contracting the construction service providers, these facilities were re-established in the final design documentation and constructed, except the facility for sniffing dogs.

Some delays were registered in the project implementation from early 2016: (i) the design of the JOBCP took more time than planned due to the need of a significant revision of the design plan developed by the Customs Service in 2012 – about 50 meetings between the design company and the four border partner services from Moldova and Ukraine were organized to agree on all the details of the design; and (ii) slow procedures of additional land acquisition needed for the JOBCP’s constructions by the Customs Service, also explained by the change of the Director General of the Customs Service. To speed up the process of land acquisition, the new Head of the Customs Service chaired a working meeting with the representatives of the Customs Service, the Cadaster State Agency, the Ministry of Finance and the Mayor of Palanca on April 13, 2016. As a result, on May 16, 2016 the Local Council of Palanca approved the decision on the transfer of the needed 2.3 ha of land into the property of the Customs Service.

On May 27, 2016 UNDP launched the tender no. ITB16/0127 on the Construction of the Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca. The deadline for the tender was July 20, 2016, allowing sufficient time for the potential bidders to submit the applications. The tender announcement was disseminated through specialized networks as well as to our UNDP website and local email lists. During the tender period two familiarization site-visits and one information conference was organized to help the potential offerors clarify various aspects of the technical design and the construction process. Thus, 15 companies were registered in the process and were actively requiring information and asking clarification questions during the tender process. However, only four (4) offers received by the deadline in the amounts of EUR 3,274,275.50, EUR 3,662,752.37, EUR 3,994,301.63, and EUR 4,050,958.42. Two (2) offers (EUR 3,274,275.5 and EUR 4,050,958.42) did not qualify, while the amount allocated for the construction works in the project budget, as approved in the Agreement no. ENPI-2014/355-024 is EUR 2.5 million, including the JOBCP design and the construction supervision services.

Hence, two (2) remaining offers were further analyzed, and additional clarifications were requested from the Offeror 1 on the cost breakdown.

However, it was noted that both qualifying offers exceeded the available budget, as per the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Offer 1</th>
<th>Deficit Offer 1</th>
<th>Offer 2</th>
<th>Deficit Offer 2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Project Budget construction s</td>
<td>3,662,752.37</td>
<td>-1,446,328.37</td>
<td>3,994,301.63</td>
<td>-1,777,877.63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EUR</td>
<td>2,216,424.00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

UNDP jointly with the Customs Service of the Republic of Moldova undertook additional resource mobilization efforts that resulted in allocation by the Government of Moldova of 4.5 Million MDL (EUR 260,000.00) on December 21, 2016, and 7.52 Million MDL (EUR 300,000.00) under the project “Construction of Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova”.

Final Report, May 2019
on January 2, 2017. Based on that, on January 19, 2017, UNDP requested the EUD to perform a budget revision, adding the additional contribution of the Government of Moldova in the amount of EUR 560,000.00 to the Budget Heading “Constructions”, and reallocating EUR 606,646 from the Budget Heading “Equipment” to the Budget Heading “Constructions”. The consultations with the partner services and the EUBAM experts confirmed that the reduced funding for the procurement of equipment would not have a negative impact on the functionality of the JOBCP, as some of the equipment would be optimized, and some would be offered in-kind by the partner services. EUD approved the Budget Revision, as requested, through the Addendum no.1 to the Contract, signed on February 17, 2017.

In parallel, UNDP proceeded to the final phase of the tender and started negotiations with the winning company aiming to achieve a cost-reduction. The negotiation process proved to be very difficult, as the company had to provide cost offers addressing the changes in the technical design that implied new elements and items. The company replied with extended delays, while the offered prices in some instances were much higher than the designer’s estimations, but those was supported by the credible evidence for the increases in unit prices and the overall re-assessed offer. At the same time, the company had obvious difficulties in obtaining the Bank advance guarantee, as was requested in the tender conditions and were reflected in the Contract and not extended the Bank security guarantee. Due to these reasons and to avoid further delays and eventual difficulties in dealing with an unreliable Contractor, a decision was taken to stop the negotiations and to cancel the tender announced in 2016.

The decision was approved by the Project Steering Committee on March 30, 2017. In order to decrease the costs of the construction works, in parallel to save time by implementing the preparations works and to review the design replacing some options and materials for the cheaper ones without affecting the functionality of the JOBCP and its compliance with the EU Integrated Border Management principles, the same Project Steering Committee decided to divide the works into 3 Lots to be tendered separately:

Lot no. 1 - the works for the removal of utility networks;

Lot no. 2 - the demolition of unnecessary buildings, expansion and levelling of the territory of the JOBCP;

Lot no. 3 - the construction works per se.

The change in the approach to the procurement of the construction works positively influenced the progress in the project’s implementation. The three Lots were launched in a sequenced manner allowing time for the revision of the JOBCP design in view of cost efficiency. It also provided other benefits: the revision of the JOBCP design did not affect the speed of the works; the procurement processes were at needed speed; particular types of works started with the necessary sequencing or in parallel; important cost savings achieved, as the bidders for each lot did not have to facture much of sub-contracting, as the Lots were focused on the specific types of works, all allowing to bring the Project back on track with a view to finalizing the construction of the JOBCP by the initially planned date – December 2018.

The tender for the Lot no.1 “Telecommunications cable networks relocation works” was launched on March 21, 2017. The duration of the contract signed with “Promtel” SRL was from

“Construction of Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova”
Final Report, May 2019
April 28 to July 31, 2017. The works started on May 10, 2017 with the demolition of the metal canopy standing over the Odessa - Reni road M15 during the suspension of the main traffic on the road M15 related to the reparation of the bridge in Mayaki. In parallel, the telecommunication networks’ replacement started. In accordance with the design the following cables were relocated: telecommunication cable of “Atraom” LTD and Border Guard Service of Ukraine; optic fiber cables of “Moltelecom” SA; optic fiber cables of “Etelcom International”; and a new optic fiber cable from Palanca village to the Customs Service server. Cable diversion works were commissioned to utility owners by acceptance protocols.

The contract under Lot no.2 was signed with “Prestigiu AZ” SRL (June 6 - October 9, 2017). The Contractor entered the site and started preparatory works immediately after the replacement of the telecommunication networks for the future construction site (June 23, 2017). The assignment included: Extension of the territory; Tree clearance; Removal of top soil and stockpiling for a subsequent reuse on the site; Construction of an embankment platform with compacted layers of clay material; Demolition of the old custom’s facilities; and Fencing of the construction site. During the execution of works a problem was identified with the platform’s stability in wet areas of the flood channels on the expanded territory of the future JOBCP. The designer proposed to fill the discovered channels with the coarse gravel of different fraction, and the works were successfully executed by the Contractor. All works under Lot 2 were completed by the end of October 2017.

To ensure the functionality of the BCP during the construction works, the temporary border crossing point Palanca was established. For this, additional works were contracted to both construction companies already present on the site: Promtel SRL and Prestigiu AZ SRL. The additional works for the establishment of the temporary BCP were completed by the end of July 2017.

In parallel, the designer performed a new revision of the JOBCP’s design. The final format of the revised design was presented to the partners and approved on May 10, 2017. Following this, the procurement of the construction works under Lot no.3 started on May 17, 2017 with subsequent extension of the deadline till July 10, 2017, to ensure a wider competition. By the extended deadline 3 (three) bids were received. UNDP with the support of the Project's International Consultant/Engineer evaluated the bids, while the Beneficiary and the Donor representatives observed the process of the bids’ evaluation. The Evaluation Panel identified Barzine Cons SRL as the best offeror at both the technical compliance to the tender requirements and the financial offer. The Civil Works contract was signed on September 11, 2017 to be finalized by November 30, 2018. The contract amount was within the preliminary cost estimate (Bill of Quantities developed by the designer) and within the budget available in the “Infrastructure/Civil Construction (including detailed design)” Project’s Budget Line.

Barzine Cons SRL has started site activities immediately after acceptance of the site from the contractor under Lot no.2 (expansion and levelling of the grounds) on October 23, 2017. The works were performed in line with the agreed schedule, with some minor delays caused by certain mistakes in the design and by weather conditions. To speed up the finalization of the
works, the Contractor mobilized additional staff, in total reaching 100-110 workers on the construction site.

To ensure the professional supervision of the construction works in line with the national legislation, the following national consultants had been contracted by the Project at certain stages of the construction works:

**The Technical Supervisor** to provide the quality assurance on site, ensure quality of the works and their compliance to the design and with the national construction regulations and standards during the whole construction phase of the project;

**The Technical Supervision in Telecommunication** for ensuring that all works and materials used in the telecommunication equipment’s installation correspond to the standards and norms, as required by the national legislation in constructions.

**The Environmental Consultant** to ensure environmental standards, protection and risk mitigation measures, as well as social standards are respected by the project Contractors. The Consultant has elaborated the Environmental Impact Assessment (EIA) Report and the Environmental Management Plan (EMP);

**Laboratory testing of works** to ensure monitoring and measurement of the quality of compaction works was performed by the independent certified laboratory “CMAC” - National Centre of Applied Metrology and Certification. A total number of 74 laboratory tests were performed at various levels of the newly constructed and compacted platform. Based on this verification the compaction degree at site proved to be in compliance with the standards, design and technical specifications.

**Topographical survey of works** to measure the quantity of compaction works and to ensure the compliance with the levels provided by the design was performed by the specialized topographical company “Simbo Proiect” SRL. The company performed surveying of the levels at different phases of compaction works and submitted periodical reports on the independent control of quantities. The reports confirmed the quantities as presented in the Contractor’s reports.

**The Technical Supervision of electrical works** to check and oversee the electrical works’ quality and execution in accordance with the design, technical specifications, method statements and standards and with the regulations for specialized works.

**The Technical Supervision of specialized works** to ensure the quality and compliance with the national standards of the heating systems, air-conditioning and ventilation.

**The Construction Consultant** to provide technical support to the Project team in the supervision and monitoring of various construction, design and related activities for an efficient, qualitative and timely completion of the construction works in April 2018, when the works had reached the pick and enhanced monitoring and identification of emerging issues was necessary for the timely completion of works.

The above expertise contracted by the Project has ensured enough instruments for ensuring the quality of the different types of works during of the construction. Based on this, a mutual agreement was reached with the Project’s International Consultant/Engineer to end his assignment on 31 August 2017.

In addition to the services provided by the national consultants the Project Manager and the Project Officer/Engineer carried out weekly site visits. During each visit, the construction activities were

“Construction of Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova”

*Final Report, May 2019*
recorded. Weekly coordination technical meetings were held with the Contractors on the on-going and planned construction works, design issues, technical proposals on optimization of the design, mobilization of the Contractors’ teams and equipment, as well as on the progress of works and solutions for emerging issues. Weekly briefs on the Project’s activities had been submitted to the Donors from early 2017, substituted later on by the bi-weekly briefs.

The Project’s Risk Log was updated quarterly alongside with the mitigation measures, presented and discussed at the Project Steering Committee Meetings, and recorded in the Project’s Progress Reports and in UNDP’s ATLAS system.

In 2018, the Government of Moldova contributed additional funds to the project in the amount of EUR 629,912.00 for the construction of the road junction between the JOBCP and Odessa-Reni highway. These funds were added to the Project Budget through the Addendum No.2 to the Agreement 2014/355-024 signed on June 29, 2018. The Project started the construction of the access road in August, the additional workload was implemented by the same size Project Team with the support of the contracted national Technical Supervisor for road construction works.

During the execution of the construction works several design issues were revised, either to apply more effective solutions or to meet the beneficiary’s requests. These changes entailed modifications in the quantities and in construction solutions, in terms of both increases and reductions. All necessary design revisions and corrections of the Bill of Quantities (BoQ) were performed by the IGC Construct SRL contracted in 2015 to elaborate the design a of the future JOBCP and the initial BoQ.

The design revisions/corrections were accomplished based on the following:

1. Design revisions and additional works imposed by the actual site conditions;
2. Additional works requested by the beneficiaries;
3. Additional works requested by the utility networks owners or state inspections;
4. The need to exclude some works due to the more effective solutions.

The changes described above required the Contract amendment with Barzine Cons SRL, both in terms of costs increase and the time extension.

The Construction works were finalized by the date indicated in the Contract Agreement’ Addendum – December 22, 2018, in line with the design’s requirements.

**Activity 2: Procurement of equipment**

Initially, this phase of the project was planned to start in mid-2017. Considering that the preliminary List of Equipment enclosed as Appendix 2 to the Description of Action was developed back in 2012 being very estimative, the project team has engaged key stakeholders in a critical review of the list of equipment. The analysis considered what equipment would be needed for the effective functioning of the JOBCP and the adequate reflection of costs and operational parameters. Intensive consultations were held with the partner services from Moldova and Ukraine with the support of the EUBAM. The in-depth review of the list and of the design drawings prepared based on the requests of the partner services identified that several key positions, such as the LAN, fiber optics and CCTV system were initially underestimated in
costs. Also partner services requested increased quantities for some items compared to the initial List of Equipment. The revised List of Equipment was signed in February 2017 by all partner services.

It was planned to start the procurement of the equipment in October 2017, but a thorough analysis of the type of equipment (mainly ICT) in the view of the estimated time for the procurement and delivery demonstrated that it would be feasible to start the procurement in 2018, when a significant progress of works will be achieved. In addition, more clarifications were made with regards to the technical specifications for particular items, and the project team continued the consultations with the partner services in order to agree on the technical specifications and the quantities in the limits of the available budget. The Project team has initiated weekly consultations with the beneficiaries for the final review of quantities and of the technical specifications for the equipment, as the specifications and quantities for many types of equipment were well beyond the real needs of the JOBCP. The project team insisted on adjusting the specifications to the real needs of the JOBCP in terms of the capacity of the equipment and its quantities. The discussions and adjustments with the Moldovan partners were finalized by the end of July 2018. In parallel, the Customs Service and the Border Police of Moldova made a review of the available equipment in their possession that could be used in the new JOBCP, and based on this analysis proposed some optimizations, deletions or change of equipment included into the initial List of Equipment. As a result, the List of Equipment was further adjusted, and the estimative costs were updated, correcting the previous mistakes. The compromise achieved on both the technical specifications and on quantities did not have a negative impact on the quality and functionality of the equipment and ensured the real needs of the JOBCP were met. The procurement of the e-Ticket system was cancelled, as the Customs Service of RM could not provide the Concept and the technical specifications, and in addition, it was unlikely that the Ukrainian partner services would be ready for the implementation of the e-Ticket system, as it requires the interoperability of certain e-registers that might contain the confidential information. The final List of Equipment signed by partner services on August 14, 2018 is enclosed as Annex no.1 to this Report.

All equipment as per the approved final List of Equipment was purchased, except the e-Ticket system, and transferred to the property of the partner services, as per Annex no. 2. The savings incurred due to the exclusion of some equipment positions were proposed to be used for the procurement of the furniture for the JOBCP and for the construction of the external toilet on the exit to Ukrainian side of the JOBCP, excluded from the construction plan at an earlier stage. These changes were approved through the Addendum no.3 of the Contribution Agreement, signed on September 4,2018.
V. SUSTAINABILITY OF RESULTS

The project results are sustainable, as the JOBCP facilities built by the Project and the procured equipment were handed over to the beneficiaries. The JOBCP is fully and uninterruptedly operating since the official launch on December 28, 2018.

VI. PROJECT RISKS, ISSUES AND ACTIONS TAKEN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description of risk</th>
<th>Risk management actions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Technical specifications for tenders are not duly/in timely elaborated</td>
<td>A specialized design company for developing the tender documentation and a short-term international expert to evaluate the quality of documentation contracted</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The four partner services cannot come to a common understanding on the JOBCP’s design</td>
<td>Detailed design elaborated in collaboration with the partner services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure on land acquisition is longer than estimated due to bureaucracy</td>
<td>Procurement procedures started by the Customs Service before the project launch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procedure on land acquisition fails due to the lack of funds</td>
<td>Funds secured in the public budget</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Insufficient number of qualifying bids for the construction works</td>
<td>Tender announcement published on the UNDP international website and circulated through the relevant networks.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction authorization procedure is longer than estimated due to bureaucracy</td>
<td>Authorization procedure started in parallel with the tender announcement.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bids submitted under the tender on construction exceed the available funds</td>
<td>Additional fundraising efforts resulted in additional funding by the Government.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>A revision of the design performed to find cheaper solutions not affecting the functionality of the JOBCP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>List of equipment was critically reviewed and revised that allowed to transfer some funds to the Construction Budget Heading.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description of risk</td>
<td>Risk management actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction works are not finalized on time due to the failure of the first tender</td>
<td>The construction works tendered in three (3) Lots, allowing to save time and implement some works in parallel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction works interrupt the border crossing in Palanca for a long period of time</td>
<td>The temporary BCP established</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low quality of construction works/deviations from the design</td>
<td>International consultant/engineer contracted to ensure the bids are in line with the design; Licensed Technical Supervisors for overseeing specific types of works contracted; Permanent monitoring of the quality of works on the construction site carried out by the Project team; Sources and quality of the construction materials verified before the delivery on the site by certified specialized laboratories; Quality and volumes of works and of the construction materials tested by Services of certified specialized laboratories on the construction site; Accuracy and potential deviations of the ground levels kept under control by a professional surveying company.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final construction costs might increase due to unforeseen circumstances</td>
<td>Constant supervision of works on the site; Thorough review of the interim payment certificates provided by the contractor vs real quantities of the performed works at the site.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The absence of the access roads at the entrances to the JOBCP from Ukraine and Moldova do not allow for a proper functioning of the JOBCP</td>
<td>Resource mobilization efforts for the road construction resulted in the allocation of additional resources by the Government of Moldova for the construction of the access road from the Ukrainian side; Additional land (0,6 ha) for the construction of the access road to JOBCP from the Ukrainian side allocated by Palanca Local Council and transferred into the Customs Service property; The design, BoQ and a Cost Estimate for the access road from the Moldovan side were handed over to the Ministry of Economy and Infrastructure that ensured a temporary solution. The access road from the Moldovan side will be finalized along with the renovation of the road connecting the JOBCP with Chisinau – Tudora highway going through Palanca village, planned for 2019.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description of risk</td>
<td>Risk management actions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Weather conditions might cause delays at the final stage of the construction works</td>
<td>The Contractor identified effective solutions allowing fluent execution of works despite of the weather conditions;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Contractor periodically reviewed the agreed Programme of Works and timely modified it in case of delays, including additional measures to compensate the time loss;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Constant supervision of works on the site by the Project Team and consultants;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Increase of the manpower for finishing works;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Organization of the works in two shifts at the final stage.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delays in the approval of the technological scheme for the joint controls had an</td>
<td>The partner services tested the joint control procedures in the Temporary BCP;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>impact on the partition of rooms in the administrative building and on the design of</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IT and electricity utilities</td>
<td>The tests allowed to finalize the technological scheme.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delayed finalization and approval by the beneficiaries of the technical specifications for equipment</td>
<td>Weekly technical meeting on the equipment list and the technical specifications with the partner services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cost of equipment is higher than the allocated budget</td>
<td>Additional consultations, prioritization and technical specifications for the equipment held with the partner services to reduce the costs while ensuring the full functionality of the JOBCP.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tender procedure on equipment procurement fails</td>
<td>Equipment divided into specific lots tendered separately and in a sequenced manner.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Delayed deliveries of equipment</td>
<td>Effectively manage the Contacts on the equipment procurement;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Regular (weekly) engagement with the suppliers on the delivery terms;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Negotiations with the suppliers on shortening the delivery terms.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
VII. LESSONS LEARNT

The key lessons learned are the following:

- A feasibility study and a thorough estimation of the costs of construction works shall be carried out before starting similar complex infrastructure projects;

- Elaboration of the detailed bill of quantities in accordance with the final construction drawings allows quantitative control of volumes of works and saves money;

- Division of some specific and independent types of construction works into lots tendered separately saves time and resources, and also allows for a better and focused supervision of works and the quality control;

- High attention, commitment and the ownership of the Government of Moldova to the Project is instrumental in the successful implementation of the task;

- JOBCP Palanca Project experience could be successfully replicated in Moldova or in another country.
VIII. PROJECT VISIBILITY

From December 2014 to December 2018, the JOBCP Palanca Project organized and participated in more than 10 public events, among them:

**Four EU village events** with the presentation of the project and distribution of information materials to the wider public.

**Three Visibility events** for reporting on the progress of construction by the Customs Service with participation of the EUD, Government of Moldova, Customs Service, UNDP and other partners, including Ukrainian side were organized on 27 May 2015, 20 April 2018, and 28 December 2018 and widely reflected in mass-media.

Media visits to the construction site organized periodically in 2017 – 2018 to demonstrate the progress in the implementation of the project and the information was reflected in mass-media.

UNDP regularly published the information on the progress in the implementation of the project using various media tools in due compliance with the EU visibility requirements.

The story about the benefits of the pedestrian crossing point established at Palanca JOBCP was published in August 2018: [https://magazine.un.md/better-conditions-for-the-travellers-and-drivers-crossing-palanca-checkpoint-aec43c59f385](https://magazine.un.md/better-conditions-for-the-travellers-and-drivers-crossing-palanca-checkpoint-aec43c59f385)

The story describing the future Palanca JOBCP and its benefits for the border crossers and the staff of the border control partner services was published on UNDP blogs site:


[https://unpmoldova.exposure.co/rapid-confortabil-i-eficient-bine-ai-venit-la-punctul-de-trecere-a-frontierei-palanca](https://unpmoldova.exposure.co/rapid-confortabil-i-eficient-bine-ai-venit-la-punctul-de-trecere-a-frontierei-palanca)

The story on the access road from the Ukrainian side was published in August 2018: [http://www.md.undp.org/content/moldova/en/home/presscenter/pressreleases/2018/0-nou_por_iune-de-drum-va-lega-punctul-de-trecere-palanca-de-os.html](http://www.md.undp.org/content/moldova/en/home/presscenter/pressreleases/2018/0-nou_por_iune-de-drum-va-lega-punctul-de-trecere-palanca-de-os.html)


The story about the launch of the JOBCP Palanca was published on 28 December 2018: [http://www.md.undp.org/content/moldova/en/home/presscenter/pressreleases/2018/sprijin-european-noul-punct-de-trecere-a-frontierei-de-la-palan0.html](http://www.md.undp.org/content/moldova/en/home/presscenter/pressreleases/2018/sprijin-european-noul-punct-de-trecere-a-frontierei-de-la-palan0.html)

**Links to the publications:**

During December 2014 - November 2018 the Palanca JOBCP project was highlighted in the following news and publications:
Construction of Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova

Final Report, May 2019

http://www.noi.md/news_id/237149
http://moldpres.md/news/2017/08/01/17005922
http://jurnalty.md/news/2017/7/26/restrictii-de-circulatie-la-palanca-10294846/
http://www.realitata.md/atentie-se-anunta-restrictii-de-circulatie-prin-punctul-de-trecere---palanca----_61629.html
https://www.republikanews.md/restrictii-de-circulatie-la-punctul-de-trecere-frontierei-palanca/
http://www.ziarelive.ro/stiri/restrictii-de-circulatie-la-vama-palanca.html
https://undpmoldova.exposure.co/rapid-confortabil-i-eficient-bine-ai-venit-la-punctul-de-trecere-a-frontierei-palanca
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1432054560197681
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1423999634336507
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1418397794986691
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1408041305932340
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1388062434596894
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1383529871716817
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1351727128230425
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1473992012670602
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1485427498193720
http://www.realitata.md/punctul-de-trecere-a-frontierei----palanca----reconstructia-caruia-se-ridica-la-milioane-de-euro--prinde-contur--foto--66980.html
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1512810342122102
http://customs.gov.md/ro/content/republica-moldova-si-ucraina-lanseaza-controlul-comun-punctul-de-trecere-temporar-palanca
http://trm.md/ro/social/control-comun-la-punctul-de-trecere-a-frontierei-palanca-maiaki/
http://prot.md/stiri/actualitate/vamesii-si-politistii-de-frontiera-moldoveni-si-ucraineni-vor--2105971.html
https://web.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/videos/1521598791243257/
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/videos/1583801391689663/
https://www.facebook.com/PNUDMoldova/posts/1598839670185835
Construction of Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova

Final Report, May 2019
Construction of Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova

Final Report, May 2019
IX. **ANNEXES**

**Annex no.1.** The final List of Equipment approved by all partner services on August 14, 2018.

"Construction of Jointly Operated Border Crossing Point Palanca on the territory of the Republic of Moldova"

*Final Report, May 2019*
Annex no.2. Transfer of title of goods to the following beneficiaries:
2.1. Customs Service of the RM as of 22 December 2018;
2.2. GI Border Police as of 22 December 2018;
2.3. Customs Service of Ukraine as of 22 December 2018;
2.4. Border Guard Service of Ukraine as of 22 Dec 2018.

Annex no.3. Handover construction works signed by the Customs Service of the Republic of Moldova (National Counterpart) and UNDP as of 21 December 2018;

Annex no.4. Transfer (Donation) of the Project assets and non-assets to the local public institutions of Palanca village, as follows:
1. Title of transfer of the Project’ vehicle to the LPA of Palanca as of December 12, 2018;
2. Title of transfer of the Project’ Xerox Workcenter 5335 transferred to the Palanca Gymnasium as of December 12, 2018;
3. Title of transfer of the Project’s non-assets (IT equipment) to local Daycare Center Ekklesia as of December 19, 2018;
   Title of transfer of the Project’s non-assets (IT equipment) to Palanca Medical Center as of December 20, 2018;
   Title of transfer of the Project’s non assets to Palanca Gymnasium (IT equipment and furniture) as of December 20, 2018.

Annex no.5. Minutes of the Project Steering Committee Meetings (SCM):
SCM no.9 as of 30 November 2018;
SCM no.8 as of 7 September 2018;
SCM no.7 as of 27 July 2018;
SCM no.6 as of 28 March 2018;
SCM no.5 as of 8 December 2017;
SCM no.4 as of 30 March 2017;
SCM no.3 as of 17 May 2016;
SCM no.2 as of 21 December 2015;
SCM no.1 as of 30 October 2015.